Tongues in the Church Fathers

by

Francis Gumerlock

Introduction

The purpose of this article is to show how early Christian interpreters of the Bible understood the gift of tongues. After briefly describing a modern erroneous notion of tongues, a dossier of citations from early Christian writers, some in English translation here for the first time, will be provided. These citations, along with two accounts of alleged tongues miracles from the early church, will show that ancient Christians understood that the biblical gift of tongues was a miracle involving intelligible human languages.

Unintelligible Language?

One of the most common misunderstandings about the gift of tongues is that the miracle is an ability to speak a prayer language of which only God knows the meaning. This "ecstatic speech," made up of sounds and syllables uttered by the mouth, completely bypasses the understanding, being unintelligible even to the recipient. This gift, proponents say, is a means by which a person can communicate the innermost groanings of his spirit to God's Spirit (cf. Romans 8:26). It is sometimes equated with "the tongues of angels" that Paul spoke of in

1 Corinthians 13:1, but the *locus classicus* to support this view of tongues is, "For one who speaks in a tongue speaks not to men but to God; for no one understands him, but he utters mysteries in the Spirit" (1 Corinthians 14:2).

It is not the purpose of this article to give a thorough biblical refutation of this misunderstanding of tongues, but a few brief comments are in order. Romans 8:26 cannot refer to the gift of tongues because the passage speaks of unutterable (*alaletois*) groanings, or groanings which the KJV says "cannot be uttered." Furthermore, when 1 Corinthians 14:2 is interpreted in the context of its chapter, it yields a completely opposite meaning than that of unintelligible speech. Paul's whole argument is that tongues were not a means for private edification, but a gift to be used for communicating doctrinal content to others.

A Proper Understanding of Tongues

The gift of tongues, according to a proper understanding of Scripture, was a supernatural deposit into the mind of the recipient of a human language or languages that the recipient had not previously learned in the natural manner such as through enculturation or study. The new language or languages that the person received were intelligible human languages spoken by other people somewhere in the inhabited world. Consequently, the content of the Gospel could be communicated in that language, either to those who understood that language or to those not conversant in that language by means of an interpreter.

This understanding of the gift is clearly shown in Luke's description of the tongues miracle in the Acts of the Apostles. "And how hear we every man in our own tongue, wherein we were born? Parthians, and Medes and Elamites and residents of Mesopotamia, Judea and Cappadocia, Pontus and Asia, Phrygia and Pamphylia, Egypt and the parts of Libya belonging to Cyrene, and visitors from Rome, both Jews and proselytes, Cretans and Arabians—we hear them telling in our own tongues the mighty works of God" (Acts 2:8-11). Clearly the apostles were speaking in the languages of the various nations listed.

Tongues According to the Church Fathers

The view that the gift of tongues involves unintelligible speech is a novel teaching, having arisen less than a century ago in Pentecostal circles. In fact, the earliest Pentecostals at the beginning of the twentieth century believed that the gift involved intelligible languages such as Chinese and Hindi. However, when they discovered that Chinese and Indian people could not understand the "tongues," they by necessity had to change their understanding of the gift to unintelligible speech.¹

The early church had no such concept of the gift of tongues as unintelligible speech. The understanding of the church fathers was that the gift mentioned in both Acts and Corinthians involved the supernatural ability to speak the languages of other nations. Below are citations from ancient Christian writers,

which show that they interpreted the biblical gift of tongues as a miracle involving intelligible human languages.

Origen (d. 253), Commentary on 1 Corinthians

[On "Therefore one who speaks in a tongue should pray for the power to interpret" (1 Corinthians 14:13).]: If the one who speaks in tongues does not have the power to interpret them, others will not understand, but **he will know what he was moved by the Spirit to say**. When this is understood by others as well, there will be fruit from it. Here as elsewhere, we are taught to seek the common good of the church.²

Hilary of Poitiers (359), On the Trinity

The phrase 'Spirit of God' denotes also the Paraclete Spirit, and that not only on the testimony of prophets but also of apostles, when it is said: *This is that which was spoken through the Prophet, It shall come to pass on the last day, saith the Lord, I will pour out of My Spirit upon all flesh, and their sons and their daughters shall prophesy.* And we learn that all this prophecy was fulfilled in the case of the Apostles, when, after sending of the Holy Spirit, they all spake with **the tongues of the Gentiles**.³

Eusebius of Emesa (d. 359)

But when he [God] gave literary ability to ignorant men so that they could write gospels, giving the ability to write he also gave the Roman tongue to Galileans,

and **the languages of the world** to his apostles, for the teaching and admonition and exhortation of the nations of the world.⁴

Cyril of Jerusalem (d. 387), Catechetical Lectures

John and the rest of the apostles spake every tongue of those of Gentile extraction...What teacher can be found so great ast o teach men all at once things which they have not learned? So many years are they in learning by grammar and other arts to speak only Greek well; nor yet do all speak this equally well; the Rhetoritician perhaps succeeds in speaking well; and the Grammarian sometimes not well; and the skilful Grammarian is ignorant of the subjects of philosophy. But the Holy Spirit taught them many languages at once, languages which all their life they never knew. This is in truth vast wisdom, this is power divine. What a contrast of their long ignorance in time past to their sudden, complete and varied and unaccustomed exercise of these languages.⁵

Filastrius (d. 397), Book of Diverse Heresies

... [T]he knowledge of languages which offending men lost twenty-seven hundred years earlier the Lord conferred again through the Holy Spirit at the time of the blessed apostles after his ascension without any effort upon those who believed, as it is written in the Acts of the Apostles. For it is the power of angels to know the languages of all men; but through faith in Christ without any effort the knowledge of them all was passed on to believers.⁶

Pseudo-Constantius (405), Commentary on Paul's Epistles

"For the one who prophesies speaks edification and exhortation and consolation to people. The one who speaks in a tongue edifies only himself. But the one who prophesies edifies the church. I want you all to speak in tongues, but even more that you would prophesy. For the one who prophesies is greater than the one who speaks in a tongue, unless it is interpreted so that the church may receive edification" (1 Corinthians 14:3-5). He says, 'If I shall come to you and shall speak to you' in **the Syrian or Persian language** 'what good is that to you' who do not understand?⁷

Gaudentius (d. 410), Sermons

For being filled with the Holy Spirit they were speaking with the tongues of the various nations.⁸

John Chrysostom (d. 407), Homilies on 1 Corinthians

[On 1 Corinthians 14:1-3] Wherefore then did the Apostles receive it [the gift of tongues] before the rest? Because they were to go abroad every where. And as in the time of building the tower the one tongue was divided into many; so then the many tongues frequently met in one man, and the same person used to **discourse both in the Persian, and the Roman, and the Indian,** and many other tongues, the Spirit sounding within him: and the gift was called the gift of tongues because he could all at once speak diverse languages.⁹

Rufinus of Aquileia (d. 412), Commentary on the Apostle's Creed

They [the apostles] were thus enabled to speak a variety of different languages, with the result that they found no nation strange to them, and **no foreign speech** beyond their powers of comprehension.¹⁰

Pelagius (414), Letter to Demetrias

The Holy Spirit fills the soul, like air coming into musical pipes, and the finger of God touches the hearts of His saints like the strings of a harp. When He was poured forth upon the apostles and the community of believers on the day of Pentecost, as He had promised by the Lord, why was it that the Holy Spirit appeared in the form of fiery tongues and caused those over whom He rested to speak with **the tongues of all nations**?¹¹

Augustine (d. 430), Tractates on the Gospel of John

But "the Spirit was not yet given;" that is, with that abundance of spiritual grace which enabled those assembled together to speak in every language, and thus announce beforehand in the language of every nation the Church of the future: and so by this spiritual grace it was that the nations were gathered into congregations, sins were pardoned far and wide, and thousands of thousands were reconciled unto God.¹²

Augustine, Sermons on the Liturgical Seasons

All the people present [in the Upper Room] had learned one language. The Holy Spirit came, they were filled with it, they began to **speak with the different languages of all nations which they didn't know, and hadn't learned** . . . The fact, I mean, that small church was speaking with the tongues of all nations, what else can it signify but that this great Church *from the rising of the sun to its setting* (Ps 113:3) is speaking with the tongues of all nations?¹³

Julian of Ecclanum (d. 450), Commentary on Joel

"I will pour out my Spirit on all flesh, and your sons and your daughters will prophesy" (Joel 2:28). For since the apostles had received **the knowledge of languages** by a miracle, the teacher of the Church [Peter] showed this predicted outpouring of the Spirit, and called the knowledge of languages "prophecy." 14

Leo the Great (d. 461), Sermon 75

For as the Apostles' story testifies: "while the days of Pentecost were fulfilled and all the disciples were together in the same place, there occurred suddenly from heaven a sound as of a violent wind coming, and filled the whoe house where they were sitting. And there appeared to them divided tongues as of fire, and it sat upon each of them divided tongues as of fire, and it sat upon each one of them. And they were all filled with the Holy Spirit, and began to speak with other tongues, as the Holy Spirit gave them utterance." Oh! how swift are the words of

wisdom, and where God is the Master, how quickly is what is taught, learnt. **No** interpretation is required for understanding, no practice for using, no time for studying, but the Spirit of God blowing where He wills, the languages peculiar to each nation became common property in the mouth of the Church.¹⁵

Theodoret of Cyrus (d. 466), Commentary on 1 Corinthians

"To another the interpretation of words" (1 Corinthians 12:10). This also was a spiritual gift. For often a person who knew only the Greek language, after discoursing with another in the **language of Scythia and Thrace**, brought an interpretation to the hearers.¹⁶

"For one who speaks in a tongue, speaks not to people, but to God: for no one hears. But in the Spirit he speaks mysteries" (1 Corinthians 14:2) . . . For it was given to preachers, because of the diverse languages of people, so that one who was going to the people of India might bring the divine preaching in the language used by them. And again, when discoursing with Persians, and with Scythians, and Romans, and Egyptians, they would preach the evangelical doctrine in the languages used by each.¹⁷

Jacob of Serugh (d. 521), Homily 17 on the Sunday of Pentecost

O Upper Room, your story is exalted even more than Babel;

Because without any writing all tongues are distributed in you.

The Spirit made you as a school for the sons of the light

And they have learned from you the speech of the nations and their tongues. . .

For, on the great feast when all the nations were gathered

The tongues resounded from the Upper Room with new voices.

The Greeks and the Alans heard their own tongues

Simply from the disciples who had multiplied among the Jews. . .

In the language of the region he spoke to them so that it should become known

That he himself is the teacher, master and the Lord of the region. . .

The Good News of the Son was sent by all sorts of tongues

To the peoples of the earth who had proceeded from Babel. 18

Cassiodorus (d. 580), Commentary on Acts

[On Acts 2:1-13] With the coming of the Holy Spirit, and with all sitting in that house, fire from heaven appeared upon their heads and they spoke the languages of various nations.¹⁹

Gregory the Great (d. 603), Homilies on the Gospels

[Interpreting Acts 2:3] The Holy Spirit appeared in tongues of fire over the disciples, and gave them the **knowledge of all languages**.²⁰

Gregory the Great, Moralia on Job

There are some who, when they hear of the wonderful works of the apostles, that having received the Holy Spirit, they raised the dead with a word, cast out

demons from the obsessed, removed infirmity with their shadow, preached by prophesying things to come, and **speaking in the language of every nation**, preached the only-begotten Word of God, because they do not see these powers in the Church now, believe that heavenly grace has already been withdrawn from the Church, not knowing that they should believe what is written: "A Helper in times of tribulation" (Psalm 9:9).²¹

Two Ancient Accounts of Tongues Miracles

For as much as some have claimed that Christians in the patristic period were charismatic,²² in all of the post-Biblical literature of the early church I have found only two clear descriptions of a post-apostolic miracle of the gift of tongues.

These stories were written by Palladius and Gregory the Great respectively.

Twenty-first century Christians are not in a position to be able to verify whether or not these miracles actually had occurred. However, in both cases the author does not say that he himself witnessed the miracle. The second and third hand nature of the accounts creates suspicion concerning their veracity. Nevertheless, important information can be gathered from the accounts, namely, the way that these church fathers understood the gift of tongues. According to both accounts, the miracle of the gift of tongues involved a reception of intelligible human languages that the recipient had never learned beforehand in the natural manner.

Palladius (420), Book of Paradise

OF THE GIFT OF TONGUES WHICH PACHOMIUS RECEIVED. And it came to pass that, when the blessed Pachomius was visiting the brethren in their cells, and was correcting the thoughts of each one of them, he was obliged to visit a certain Roman, who was a nobleman of high rank, and who knew the Greek language very well. Now therefore, having come to this great man, so that he might exhort him with words which would be beneficial to him, and might learn the motions of his heart, the blessed man spake unto him in the Egyptian tongue, but the brother did not know what the blessed man said. And because the blessed man did not know how to speak Greek, RABBÂ was obliged to call some brother who would be able to interpret to each of them the things which were said by the other. Now when the brother came to interpret the Greek did not wish to declare to RABBÂ through others the defects of his heart, and he spoke unto him thus: "After God, I wish thee, and thee alone, to know the wickedness of my heart, and I do not desire to declare them unto thee through others, for I do not wish that any man except thee should hear them." And when RABBÂ heard these words he commanded the brother who had come to interpret to depart, and because RABBÂ was unable to speak to the Greek brother the words which he wished to say to him about help and redemption, for he knew nothing whatsoever of the Greek language, he made a sign to him with his hands to remain until he came [back] to him. Then RABBÂ left him, and went to pray by himself, and he stretched out his hands towards heaven, and prayed to God, saying, "O Lord, Thou Mighty One, Who sustaineth the universe, if I am not able to benefit the children of men whom Thou doest send unto me from the ends of the earth.

because I am not acquainted with their languages, what need is there for them to come? But if Thou wishest them to be saved here through me, give me, O Lord, Thou Star of all creation, the power to know their languages so that I may be able to set their souls in "the straight way." And when he had prayed for more than three hours and had entreated God to grant him this knowledge, suddenly there was sent from heaven into his right hand something which was like unto a letter written on paper, and when he had read it, he learned immediately how to speak all tongues, and he sent up praise to the Father, and to the Son, and to the Holy Ghost. And he came with great joy to that brother, and began to talk to him both Greek and Latin with such fluency that when the brother heard him, he saith that RABBÂ corrected him, as was right, and appointed to him the penance which was suitable to his defects, and he committed him to the Lord, and went forth from him.²³

Gregory the Great, Dialogues

After entering my monastery, he [Ammonius, a monk of Gregory's monastery] told me of an event that occurred during the terrible plague which devastated Rome in the days of the patrician Narses. The attorney Valerian had a servant in his home by the name of Armentarius, a boy of unusual simplicity and humility. When the plague struck this household, the boy was one of its first victims and death carried him off in a short time. But he quickly returned to life and asked to see his master. "I have been in heaven," he said, "and have found out what members of this household are going to die." After mentioning some of them by

name, he told his master not to fear because he was not to die at this time.

"But," he continued, "to prove to you that I am speaking the truth an dthat I really was in heaven, I must tell you that I received the **power of speaking all**languages. You were aware of my complete ignorance of Greek. But I shall speak Greek to you now and you will realize that I received the gift of tongues from heaven."

Then his master spoke to him in Greek, and all were astonished to hear the boy answer in the same language. Narses' sword-bearer, a Bulgarian, lived in the same house. So he, too, was brought to the sickbed to speak to the boy in Bulgarian. Though born and raised in Italy, the boy answered the sword-bearer in his own language, as if he were his fellow countryman. All were amazed. Having tried the boy's ability in these two languages of which he had been completely ignorant before, the family was now convinced that the boy could speak all languages even though he was not able to prove his powers to the full at this time. He remained alive for two days. On the third day, through an unknown judgment of God, he died in a frenzy, biting his hands and arms. All those whose death he had foretold were taken one by one, while the rest of the household was spared.²⁴

Conclusion

Evangelicals are divided over many questions concerning the gift of tongues.

One of the most controversial is whether God intended the gift to be temporary or

whether he continues to grace his Church with tongues today.²⁵ Another often debated issue is the purpose for which tongues were given, whether to signal coming judgment on unbelievers, to facilitate the spreading of the Gospel to all nations, to edify individual Christians in their prayer lives, or to serve as proof of Spirit baptism.²⁶ However, before the questions of "why" tongues were given and for what time period they were intended are answered, the more fundumental question of "what" the gift is should be settled.

Over forty years ago, Kenneth Welliver wrote a doctoral dissertation on the patristic interpretation of Acts 2. He correctly concluded that for the church fathers, Pentecost brought "a gift of remarkable understanding of and ability to use languages previous unknown," a miraculous power of speech that enabled the apostles to preach the gospel throughout the world.²⁷ In harmony with Scripture, the earliest interpreters of the New Testament understood the gift of tongues as a supernatural enablement to intelligibly speak another human language.

About the Author

Francis Gumerlock is a graduate of Montclair State University (B.A. Education, 1984), Trinity Bible Institute (Certificate of Completion, Biblical Studies, 1995), Saint Louis University (M.A., Historical Theology, 2001; Graduate Certificate in Medieval Studies, 2003). He is author of "A Fourteenth Century Rapture Citation" *Bibliotheca Sacra* 159 (2002) and *The Day and the Hour: A Chronicle*

of Christianity's Perennial Fascination with Predicting the End of the World (Powder Springs, Georgia: American Vision Press, 2000).

Notes

¹ One of the first outbreaks of "tongues" in the United States occurred in 1901 at Charles Parham's Bethel Bible Institute, when Agnes Osman began speaking and writing in tongues. Parham wrote, "I laid my hands upon her and prayed. I had scarcely repeated three dozen sentences when a glory fell upon her, a halo seemed to surround her head and face, and she began speaking in the Chinese language and was unable to speak English for three days. When she tried to write in English to tell us of her experience she wrote in Chinese, copies of which we still have in newspapers printed at that time." However, when Ozman's markings were taken to a Chinese person in Topeka for verification that they were in fact Chinese, they were unintelligible to him. Cited in John D. Hannah, "History of Pentecostalism." Lesson 9 (Dallas Theological Seminary: Unpublished notes from course of same title, n.d.), 7-8,10. Early Pentecostals believed that the gift of tongues made them instant missionaries, enabling them to preach the gospel to all nations in their own languages before the return of Christ. It is reported that one early Pentecostal, A.G. Garr, went to India expecting the people to understand his tongues as Hindi. When this was not the case, he and his wife moved to Hong Kong and studied Chinese. Ted Olsen, "American Pentecost," Christian History, Issue 58, Vol. 17:2 (1998),10-17 at 12. For more on this, Francis Gumerlock, *The Day and the Hour* (Powder Springs, Georgia: American Vision Press, 2000), 260; Vinson Synan, "The 'Second Comers':

Pentecostal Millennialism," *Christian History*, Issue 61, Vol. 18:1(1999),38-9; Joe Creech, "Visions of Glory: The Place of the Azusa Street Revival in Pentecostal History," *Church History*, 65 (1996), 405-24; D. William Faupel, *The Everlasting Gospel: The Significance of Eschatology in the Development of Pentecostal Thought* (Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996); Gary D. Long, "Chameleonic Theology: A Brief Survey of Its Modern-Day Origin, Development and Influences upon the Gospel of Christ" (Guffey, Colorado: Sovereign Grace Ministries, Inc., 1994), 11.

² Origen, *Commentary on 1 Corinthians* 4.61-62. Cited in Gerald Bray, ed., *1-2 Corinthians*. Ancient Christian Commentary on Scripture: New Testament VII. (Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity, 1999), 141.

³ Hilary of Poitiers, *On the Trinity* VIII.25. Edited by Philip Schaff, *A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church* (NPNF), 2nd series, Vol. 9 (New York: Christian Literature, 1887-1894). Reprint (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans, 1989), 144.

⁴ Eusebius of Emesa, *Disc. 9 de calice 2*. Cited in Kenneth B. Welliver, "Pentecost and the Early Church: Patristic Interpretation of Acts 2" Ph.D. dissertation (Yale University, 1961), 210.

⁵ Cyril of Jerusalem, *Catechetical Lectures* 17.16. Cited in Welliver, "Pentecost and the Early Church," 178.

⁶ Filastrius, *Book of Diverse Heresies* 104.5-6. Cited in Welliver, "Pentecost and the Early Church," 211.

Pseudo-Constantius, *Commentary on 1 Corinthians* 14.3-5. Edited by Hermann Josef Frede, *Ein neuer Paulustext und Kommentar*. Band II Die Texte (Freiburg: Herder, 1974), 155-6. "nam qui prophetat hominibus loquitur aedificationem et exhortationem et consolationem. qui loquitur linga se ipsum aedificat. qui autem prophetat ecclesiam aedificat. volo vos omnes loqui linguis. magis autem ut prophetetis. maior est enim qui prophetat. quam qui loquitur lingua. nisi si interpraetetur ut ecclesia aedificationem accipiat." 'Si ad vos' inquid 'veniam et loquar vobis' Syro sermone vel Perso, 'quod vobis prosum' non intellegentibus?

⁸ Gaudentius, Sermon 8. Cited in Welliver, "Pentecost and the Early Church," 53.

⁹ John Chrysostom, *Homilies on 1 Corinthians* 35.1. NPNF 12:209.

¹⁰ Rufinus of Aquileia, *Commentary on the Apostles Creed* 2. Cited in Welliver, "Pentecost and the Early Church," 184.

¹¹ Pelagius, *Epistle to Demetrias* 23. Sister M. Kathryn Clare Krabbe, *Epistula ad Demetriadem de Vera Humilitate: A Critical Text and Translation with Introduction and Commentary*. Patristic Studies 97 (Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1965), 207.

¹² Augustine, *Tractates on the Gospel of St. John*, Tractate 52.8. NPNF 7:289.

<sup>Augustine, Sermons on the Liturgical Seasons 267.2-3. Edmund Hill, trans.,
The Works of Saint Augustine. Part III—Sermons. Volume 7, Sermons 230-272B. Edited by John E. Rotelle (New Rochelle, New York: New City Press, 1990), 274-5.</sup>

¹⁴ Julian of Ecclanum, *Commentary on Joel* II.28-31. Edited by Lucas De Coninck, *Iuliani Aeclanensis, Expositio Libri Iob, Tractatus Prophetarum Osee, Iohel, et Amos.* Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina, Vol. 88 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1977), 247. "Effundam spiritum meum super omnen carnem, et prophetabunt filii vestri et filiae vestrae." Quia enim linguarum scientiam apostoli miraculo fuerant consecuti, praedictam hanc effusionem Spiritus Ecclesiae doctor ostendit, et prophetiam appellavit linguarum scientiam.

¹⁵ Leo the Great, *Sermon 75*. Cited in R. Leonard Carroll, "Glossalalia: Apostles to The Reformation" Edited by Wade H. Horton, *Glossolalia Phenomenon* (Cleveland, Tennessee: Pathway, 1966), 90.

Theodoret of Cyrus, Commentary on 1 Corinthians 12:10. Edited by J.P. Migne, Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Graeca (PG), Vol. 82 (Paris: Petit-Montrouge, 1857-1866), 326A-B. "Alii interpretatio sermonum." Erat hoc quoque spirituale donum. Saepe enim homo, qui linguam Graecam solam noverat, alio lingua Scythica et Thracica disserente, afferebat auditoribus interpretationem.

Theodoret, Commentary on 1 Corinthians 14:2. PG 82:338C-D. "Qui enim loquitur lingua, non hominibus loquitur, sed Deo: nemo enim audit. Spiritu autem loquitur mysteria."... Datum enim est praedicatoribus, propter diversas hominum voces, ut qui ad Indos veniebant, illorum usi lingua divinam afferent praedicationem: et cum Persis rursus disserentes, et cum Scythis, et Romanis, et Aegyptiis, singulorum linguis usi, evangelicam doctrinam praedicarent.

¹⁸ Jacob of Serugh, *Homily 17 on the Sunday of Pentecost*, Lines 175-8, 205-8, 295-6, 335-6. Thomas Kollamparampil, trans., *Jacob of Serugh. Select Festal Homilies* (Rome: Center for Indian and Inter-religious Studies, 1997), 353-69. ¹⁹ Cassiodorus, *Commentary on Acts* 2:1. Edited by J.P. Migne, *Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Latina* (PL), Vol. 70 (Paris: Petit-Montrouge, 1844-1864), 1383. *Adveniente Spiritu sancto, cunctisque in ipsa domo sedentibus supra caput caelestis ignis apparuit, et diversarum nationum linguas locuti sunt.* ²⁰ Gregory the Great, *Homilies on the Gospels*, Homily 30.4. PL 79:1087. *Spiritus sanctus super discipulos in igneis linguis apparuit, omnium linguarum scientiam dedit.*

²¹ Gregory the Great, *Moralia in Iob* 27.36. PL 79:1327-1328. *Sunt nonnulli qui cum mira apostolorum opera audiunt, quod accepto Spiritu sancto mortuos verbo suscitarent, ab obsessis daemonia pellerent, umbra infirmitates amoverent, ventura quaeque prophetando praedicarent, et unigentium Verbum Dei, omnium gentium loquentes lingua, praedicarent, quia virtutes has nunc in Ecclesia non vident, subtractam jam ab Ecclesia supernam gratiam suspicantur, nescientes pensare quod scriptum est: Adjutor in opportunitatibus in tribulatione (Psal. <i>IX*,10).

²² Stanley M. Burgess, "Proclaiming the Gospel with Miraculous Gifts in the Postbiblical Early Church" Edited by Greig, Gary S., and Kevin N. Springer, *The Kingdom and the Power* (Ventura, California: Regal, 1993), 277-88; Lloyd D. Franklin, "Spiritual Gifts in Tertullian" Ph.D. diss., St. Louis University, 1989; E. Glenn Hinson, "The Significance of Glossolalia in the History of Christianity"

Edited by Watson E. Mills, Speaking in Tongues: A Guide to Research on Glossolalia (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans, 1986), 181-204; C.M. Robeck, Jr., "The Role and Function of Prophetic Gifts for the Church at Carthage, AD 202-258" Ph.D. diss., Fuller Theological Seminary, 1985; Burgess, *The Spirit* and the Church: Antiquity (Peabody, Massachusetts: Hendrickson, 1984); Ronald A.N. Kydd, Charismatic Gifts in the Early Church (Peabody, Massachusetts: Hendrickson, 1984); John Wimber, A Brief Sketch of Signs and Wonders Through the Church Age (Placentia, California: Vineyard Christian Fellowship, 1984); H.M. Evans, "Tertullian: Pentecostal at Carthage" Paraclete, 9:4 (1974),17-21; Louis Bouyer, "Charismatic Movements in History Within the Church Tradition," One in Christ, 10:2 (1974),148-61; William M. Green, "Glossolalia in the Second Century," Restoration Quarterly, 16 (1973):231-239. Still convincing, however, is the study of Cleon L. Rogers, Jr., challenging the claim that tongue speaking was a normal Christian experience in the postapostolic church. "The Gift of Tongues in the Post Apostolic Church (A.D. 100-400), Bibliotheca Sacra, 122 (1965),134-43.

²³ Palladius, *Book of Paradise*, "The Monks of Tabenna—Chapter XV". E.A Wallis Budge, trans., *The Book of Paradise*, Vol. 1, English Translation. Lady Meux Manuscript No. 6. (London: W. Drugulin, 1904), 468-9.

²⁴ Gregory the Great, *Dialogues* 4.27. Edited by Schopp, L, R.J. Deferrari, H. Dresler, and T.P. Halton, *Fathers of the Church*, Vol. 39 (Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1947-), 222-3.

²⁵ O. Palmer Robertson, *The Final Word: A Biblical Response to the Case for* Tongues and Prophecy Today. 1993. Reprint. (Carlisle, Pennsylvania: Banner of Truth Trust, 1997); Wayne A. Grudem, ed., Are Miraculous Gifts for Today? Four Views (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan, 1996); Jon Ruthven, On the Cessation of the Charismata: The Protestant Polemic on Postbiblical Miracles (Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press, 1993); E.B. Dennis, "The Duration of the Charismata: An Exegetical and Theological Study of 1 Corinthians 13.10" M.A. thesis, CBN University, 1989; Thomas R. Edgar, "The Cessation of the Sign Gifts," Bibliotheca Sacra, 145 (1988),371-86; Benjamin B. Warfield, Counterfeit Miracles. 1918. Reprint. (Carlisle, Pennsylvania: Banner of Truth Trust, 1986); R.S. Barnes, "The Miraculous Gifts of the Holy Spirit: Have They Ceased?" Pastoral Practice, 7 (1984),18-35; Edgar, Miraculous Gifts: Are They for Today? (Neptune, New Jersey: Loizeaux Brothers, 1983); R.W. Graves, "Tongues Shall Cease: A Critical Study of the Supposed Cessation of the Charismata," Paraclete, 17:4 (1983),20-8; Herbert Vander Lugt, Are Tongues for Today? (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Radio Bible Class, 1979); R.L. Thomas, "Tongues...Will Cease," Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society, 17 (1974), 81-9; S. Fowler, "The Continuance of the Charismata," Evangelical Quarterly, 45 (1973),172-83; G. Thomas, "The Cessation of the Extraordinary Gifts: Historical Evidence," Banner of Truth, 118 (1973), 17-21; D. MacLeod, "Has the Charismatic Age Ceased?" Banner of Truth, 85 (1970),13-20. ²⁶ Peter Masters and John C. Whitcomb. *The Charismatic Phenomenon*. 2nd ed. (London: Wakeman Trust, 1988), 35-9, 48-54, 105-8; Max Turner, "Spiritual Gifts

Then and Now," *Vox Evangelica*, 15 (1985),7-64; J.J. Murray, "Have Miraculous Gifts Ceased?" *Scottish Bulletin of Evangelical Theology*, 3 (1985),55-9; H.H. Hoehner, "The Purpose of Tongues in 1 Corinthians 14.20-25" Edited by D. Campbell, *Walvoord: A Tribute*. (Chicago: Moody, 1982), 53-66; Ronald E. Baxter, *The Charismatic Gift of Tongues* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Kregel, 1981), 41-54; B.C. Johanson, "Tongues: A Sign for Unbelievers? A Structural and Exegetical Study of 1 Corinthians 14.20-25," *New Testament Studies*, 25 (1979),180-203; George W. Zeller, *God's Gift of Tongues: The Nature, Purpose, and Duration of Tongues as Taught in the Bible* (Neptune, New Jersey: Loizeaux Brothers, 1978); Charles R. Smith, *Tongues in Biblical Perspective*, 2nd ed. (Winona Lake, Indiana: BMH, 1973), 41-58; Donald W. Burdick, *Tongues: To Speak or Not to Speak* (Chicago: Moody, 1969), 23-31.

²⁷ Welliver, "Pentecost and the Early Church," 31, 219.